#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

#### MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

# OF THE 46<sup>TH</sup> SITTING OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY OF THE FIRST SESSION (2012-2013) OF THE TENTH PARLIAMENT OF GUYANA HELD

#### AT 1.00 P.M.

### ON TUESDAY, 9<sup>TH</sup> APRIL, 2013

# IN THE PARLIAMENT CHAMBER, PUBLIC BUILDINGS, BRICKDAM, GEORGETOWN.

#### MEMBERS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY (67)

#### Speaker (1)

The Hon Raphael G.C. Trotman, M.P., Speaker of the National Assembly

#### **MEMBERS OF THE GOVERNMENT (34)**

#### (i) People's Progressive Party/Civic (34)

Hon. Samuel A.A. Hinds, O.E., M.P., Prime Minister and Minister of Parliamentary Affairs

Hon. Clement J. Rohee, M.P., Minister of Home Affairs

Hon. Dr. Leslie S. Ramsammy, M.P., Minister of Agriculture

Hon. Mohabir A. Nandlall, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica), Attorney General and Minister of Legal Affairs

Hon. Carolyn Rodrigues-Birkett, M.P. (Region No. 9 – Upper Takutu/Upper Essequibo), Minister of Foreign Affairs

Hon. Dr. Ashni K. Singh, M.P., Minister of Finance

Hon. Robert M. Persaud, M.P. (Region No. 6 – East Berbice/Corentyne),

Minister of Natural Resources and Environment

Hon. Dr. Jennifer Westford, M.P. (Region No. 7 – Cuyuni/Mazaruni),

Minister of the Public Service

Hon. Dr. Bheri S. Ramsarran, M.P., Minister of Health

Hon. Mohamed I. Alli, M.P., Minister of Housing and Water

Hon. Dr. Frank C.S. Anthony, M.P., Minister of Culture, Youth and Sport

Hon. Brindley H.R. Benn, M.P., Minister of Public Works

Hon. Priya D. Manickchand, M.P. (Region No. 5 – Mahaica/Berbice), Minister of Education

Hon. Ganga Persaud, M.P., Minister of Local Government and Regional Development

Hon. Jennifer I.M. Webster, M.P., Minister of Human Services and Social Security

Hon. Pauline Campbell-Sukhai, M.P., Minister of Amerindian Affairs

\*Hon. Dr. Nanda K. Gopaul, M.P., Minister of Labour

Hon. Alli Baksh, M.P. (Region No. 2 – Pomeroon/Supernaam), Minister in the Ministry of Agriculture

Hon. Norman A. Whittaker, J.P., M.P. (Region No. 1 – Barima/Waini), Minister in the Ministry of Local Government and Regional Development

Hon. Bishop Juan A. Edghill, M.S., J.P., M.P., Minister in the Ministry of Finance

Ms Gail Teixeira, M.P., Government Chief Whip

Mr. Manzoor Nadir, M.P.

Mrs. Indranie Chandarpal, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Bibi S. Shaddick, M.P. (Region No. 3 – Essequibo Islands/West Demerara)

Mr. Komal Chand, C.C.H., J.P., M.P. (Region No. 3 – Essequibo Islands/ West Demerara)

Mr. Odinga Lumumba, M.P.

Mr. Neendkumar, J.P., M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Mr. Dharamkumar Seeraj, M.P.

Dr. Vishwa D.B. Mahadeo, M.P.

Rev. Dr. Kwame A. Gilbert, M.P.

\*\*Mr. Joseph Hamilton, M.P., Parliamentary Secretary in the Ministry of Health

Dr. Vindhya Vasini Persaud, M.S., M.P.

Mr. Cornel Damon, M.P. (Region No. 2 – Pomeroon/Supernaam)

Mr. Faizal M. Jafarally, M.P. (Region No. 6 – East Berbice/Corentyne)

#### Members of the Opposition (32)

#### (ii) Members of A Partnership for National Unity(25)

Brigadier (Ret'd) David A. Granger, M.S.S., M.P., Leader of the Opposition

Dr. Rupert Roopnarine, M.P.

Ms Amna Ally, M.P., Opposition Chief Whip

Mr. Basil Williams, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Mrs. Volda Lawrence, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Dr. George Norton, M.P.

Mrs. Deborah Backer, M.P., Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly

#### \*\*Non-Elected Member

Mr. Carl B. Greenidge, M.P.

Lieutenant Colonel (Ret'd) Joseph F. Harmon, M.S.M., M.P.

Mr. Keith Scott, M.P.

Ms Dawn Hastings, M.P. (Region No. 7 – Cuyuni/Mazaruni)

Mr. Winston Felix, D.S.M., M.P.

Ms Jennifer J. Wade, M.P. (Region No. 5 – Mahaica/Berbice)

Mr. Sydney Allicock, M.S., M.P.

Ms Africo Selman, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Mr. Desmond Trotman, M.P.

Ms Vanessa Kissoon, M.P. (Region No. 10 – Upper Demerara/Upper Berbice)

Mr. James A. Bond, M.P.

Mr. Ronald A. Bulkan, M.P.

Mr. Jaipaul Sharma, M.P. (Region No. 4 – Demerara/Mahaica)

Mrs. Mabel Baveghems, M.P.

Mr. John Adams, M.P. (Region No. 3 – Essequibo Islands/West Demerara)

Mr. Christopher A. Jones, M.P.

Mr. Renis Morian, M.P. (Region No. 10 – Upper Demerara/Upper Berbice)

Miss Annette N. Ferguson, M.P.

#### (iii) Members of The Alliance For Change (7)

Mr. Khemraj Ramjattan, M.P.

Mr. Moses Nagamootoo, J.P., M.P.

Mrs. Catherine Hughes, M.P.

Mrs. Valerie Garrido-Lowe, M.P.

Dr. Veersammy Ramayya, M.P. (Region No. 6 – East Berbice/Corentyne)

Ms June Eula Marcello, M.P. (Region No. 8 – Potaro/Siparuni)

Mr. Trevor Williams, M.P.

#### **OFFICERS**

Mr. Sherlock E. Isaacs, Clerk of the National Assembly

Mrs. Lilawtie Coonjah, Deputy Clerk of the National Assembly

#### **COMMENCEMENT OF SITTING**

The Sitting commenced at 2.08 p.m.

#### **PRAYERS**

The Clerk read the prayers.

#### **ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE SPEAKER**

The Speaker made the following announcements:

#### **Ambulance Facility**

"The announcements are first being that some of you or most of you would have noticed an ambulance in the compound. It is nothing to be exceptionally alarmed about. It is just as a

precaution in keeping with the undertaking given by the Parliament Office to have every facility available. There was a stretcher in the foyer there which I have asked to be removed, because I think we may be taking it a bit too far, so the stretcher would go back to the ambulance and hopefully will not be used. It was only for demonstration purposes, not to be used."

#### Resignation of Mr. Richard Allen, M.P.

"On a more serious note, Hon. Members, this morning I received a letter from Mr. Richard Allen informing me that he was resigning his seat a Member of Parliament with effect from the 5<sup>th</sup> April 2013. Mr. Allen's resignation therefore means that his seat in this National Assembly has become vacant.

The vacancy, in accordance with Section 99A of the Representation of the People Act, Chapter 103 of the Laws of Guyana, is to be filled by a person whose name is to be extracted from the list of candidates from which Mr. Allen's name was originally extracted. Mr. Allen's name was extracted from A Partnership of National Unity's list of candidates. I have, in accordance with Section 99A of the said Act, called upon the representatives of that said list to further extract from that list the name of a person who is willing to become a Member of this National Assembly to fill the vacancy in the Assembly."

#### **INTRODUCTION OF BILLS**

#### **Presentation and First Reading**

#### FISCAL ENACTMENTS (AMENDMENT) BILL 2013 – Bill No. 11/2013

The Minister of Finance, on behalf of the Government, presented the following Bill, which was read the first time:

A BILL intituled AN ACT to amend the Income Tax Act and the Property Tax Act.

(Circulated)

#### **PUBLIC BUSINESS -**

#### (i) GOVERNMENT BUSINESS

#### **MOTION**

# BUDGET SPEECH 2013 – MOTION FOR THE APPROVAL OF THE ESTIMATES OF EXPENDITURE FOR 2013

Assembly resumed the debate on the motion for the approval of the Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 2013.

(Moved by the Minister of Finance on 2012-03-25)

The following Members spoke to the motion:

Ms Gail Teixeira

Mr. Desmond Trotman

The Attorney General and Minister of Legal Affairs

#### **SUSPENSION OF SITTING**

At 4.35 p.m. the sitting was suspended for refreshments.

#### **RESUMPTION OF SITTING**

At 5.48 p.m., the sitting was resumed.

The Assembly resumed the debate on the motion for the approval of the Estimates of Expenditure for 2013.

The following Members also spoke to the motion:

Mr. Khemraj Ramjattan

The Prime Minister and Minister of Parliamentary Affairs

#### SUSPENSION OF SITTING

At 7.42 p.m. the sitting was suspended for refreshments.

#### **RESUMPTION OF SITTING**

At 8.40 p.m., the sitting was resumed.

The Assembly resumed the debate on the motion for the approval of the Estimates of Expenditure for 2013.

Brig. (Ret'd) David Granger also spoke to the motion.

Thereafter, the Minister of Finance replied.

#### **SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDER NO. 10(1)**

At 10.00 p.m., on a motion by the Prime Minister and Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, Standing Orders No. 10(1) was suspended to enable the Assembly to continue with the budget debate uninterrupted.

#### **SUSPENSION OF SITTING**

At 11.30 p.m. the sitting was suspended.

#### **RESUMPTION OF SITTING**

At 12.00 midnight the sitting was resumed.

#### **CONCLUSION OF BUDGET DEBATE**

Following the conclusion of the general debate on the motion for the approval of the Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year 2013, Assembly resolved itself into Committee of Supply to consider and dispose of the Report of the Business Sub-Committee of the Committee of Supply.

#### **In Committee of Supply**

The Speaker reported that the Business Sub-Committee of the Committee of Supply met on Tuesday, 9<sup>th</sup> April, 2013, and considered proposals (with Schedules) from the Government and Opposition, respectively, for the consideration of the Estimates of Expenditure for 2013.

The Opposition's proposal, which was moved by Mr. Carl B. Greenidge, M.P., and seconded by Mr. Khemraj Ramjattan, M.P., was passed by a majority vote.

The Government's proposal, which was moved by the Minister of Finance and seconded by the Minister of Housing and Water, was also considered and negatived by a majority vote.

The Sub-Committee agreed that the proposals (with Schedules submitted) by the Government and Opposition should be reported to the Committee of Supply and printed and circulated with the Minutes of the Proceedings.

It was noted that the Sub-Committee's Minutes, Resolution and Schedule submitted by the Opposition were circulated to Members at the sitting of the National Assembly on Tuesday, 9<sup>th</sup> April, 2013.

The Speaker further reported that the Sub-Committee had agreed that the date of the commencement of the consideration of the Estimates of Expenditure for 2013, should be decided by the National Assembly.

The Minister of Finance informed the Assembly that the Government was not in agreement with the Resolution of the Business Sub-Committee and, as such, had submitted a Minority Report (with Schedule attached) of the Business Sub-Committee.

Thereafter, the Report of the Business Sub-Committee (with Schedule submitted by the Opposition) was put and negatived on the following division:

**FOR AGAINST** Mr. T. Williams Mr. Jafarally Ms Marcello Mr. Damon Dr. Persaud Dr. Ramayya Mrs. Garrido-Lowe Rev. Gilbert Dr. Mahadeo Mrs. Hughes Mr. Nagamootoo Mr. Seeraj Mr. Neendkumar Mr. Ramjattan Ms Ferguson Mr. Lumumba Mr. Chand Mr. Morian Mr. Jones Bibi Shaddick Mr. Adams Mrs. Chandarpal Mr. Nadir Ms Baveghems Mr. Sharma Ms Teixeira Mr. Bulkan Bishop Edghill Mr. Bond Mr. Whittaker Ms Kissoon Mr. Baksh Mr. Trotman Mrs. Campbell-Sukhai Ms Selman Ms Webster Mr. Allicock Mr. G. Persaud Ms Wade Ms Manickchand Mr. Felix Mr. Benn Ms Hastings Dr. Anthony Mr. Scott Mr. Ali Lt. Col. (Ret'd) Harmon Dr. Ramsarran

Mr. Greenidge

Mrs. Backer

Dr. Westford

Mr. R. Persaud

Dr. Norton	Dr. Singh	
Mrs. Lawrence	Mrs. Rodrigues-Birkett	
Mr. B. Williams	Mr. Nandlall	
Ms Ally	Dr. Ramsammy	
Dr. Roopnarine	Mr. Rohee	
Brig.(Ret'd) Granger	Mr. Hinds	
32	32	

The Minority Report of the Business Sub-Committee (with Schedule submitted by the Government) was also <u>put</u> and <u>negatived</u> on the following division:

<u>AGAINST</u>	<u>FOR</u>
Mr. T. Williams	Mr. Jafarally
Ms Marcello	Mr. Damon
Dr. Ramayya	Dr. Persaud
Mrs. Garrido-Lowe	Rev. Gilbert
Mrs. Hughes	Dr. Mahadeo
Mr. Nagamootoo	Mr. Seeraj
Mr. Ramjattan	Mr. Neendkumar
Ms Ferguson	Mr. Lumumba
Mr. Morian	Mr. Chand
Mr. Jones	Bibi Shaddick
Mr. Adams	Mrs. Chandarpal
Ms Baveghems	Mr. Nadir
Mr. Sharma	Ms Teixeira
Mr. Bulkan	Bishop Edghill
Mr. Bond	Mr. Whittaker
Ms Kissoon	Mr. Baksh

Mr. Trotman	otman Mrs. Campbell-Sukhai		
Ms Selman	Ms Webster		
Mr. Allicock	Mr. G. Persaud		
Ms Wade	Ms Manickchand		
Mr. Felix	Mr. Benn		
Ms Hastings	Dr. Anthony		
Mr. Scott	Mr. Ali		
Lt. Col. (Ret'd) Harmon	Dr. Ramsarran		
Mr. Greenidge	Dr. Westford		
Mrs. Backer	Mr. R. Persaud		
Dr. Norton	Dr. Singh		
Mrs. Lawrence	Mrs. Rodrigues-Birkett		
Mr. B. Williams	Mr. Nandlall		
Ms Ally	Dr. Ramsammy		
Dr. Roopnarine	Mr. Rohee		
Brig.(Ret'd) Granger	Mr. Hinds		
32	32		

Thereafter, the Speaker informed Members that both the Majority and the Minority Schedules were defeated and that, in accordance with Standing Order No. 74(4), the Resolutions shall stand recommitted to the Business Sub-Committee.

## **Assembly resumed**

## **ADJOURNMENT**

At 12.20 a.m., a motion by the Prime Minister and Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to adjourned the Assembly to 2.00 p.m. today, Wednesday, 10<sup>th</sup> April, 2013, was <u>put</u> and <u>negatived</u> on the following division:

AGAINST	<u>FOR</u>	
Mr. T. Williams	Mr. Jafarally	
Ms Marcello	Mr. Damon	
Dr. Ramayya	Dr. Persaud	
Mrs. Garrido-Lowe	Rev. Gilbert	
Mrs. Hughes	Dr. Mahadeo	
Mr. Nagamootoo	Mr. Seeraj	
Mr. Ramjattan	Mr. Neendkumar	
Ms Ferguson	Mr. Lumumba	
Mr. Morian	Mr. Chand	
Mr. Jones	Bibi Shaddick	
Mr. Adams	Mrs. Chandarpal	
Ms Baveghems	Mr. Nadir	
Mr. Sharma	Ms Teixeira	
Mr. Bulkan	Bishop Edghill	
Mr. Bond	Mr. Whittaker	
Ms Kissoon	Mr. Baksh	
Mr. Trotman	Mrs. Campbell-Sukhai	
Ms Selman	Ms Webster	
Mr. Allicock	Mr. G. Persaud	
Ms Wade	Ms Manickchand	
Mr. Felix	Mr. Benn	
Ms Hastings	Dr. Anthony	
Mr. Scott	Mr. Ali	

Lt. Col. (Ret'd) Harmon	Dr. Ramsarran		
Mr. Greenidge	Dr. Westford		
Mrs. Backer	Mr. R. Persaud		
Dr. Norton	Dr. Singh		
Mrs. Lawrence	Mrs. Rodrigues-Birkett		
Mr. B. Williams	Mr. Nandlall		
Ms Ally	Dr. Ramsammy		
Dr. Roopnarine	Mr. Rohee		
Brig.(Ret'd) Granger	Mr. Hinds		
32	32		

At 12.25 a.m., the Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 8, was adjourned to 2.00 p.m. on Wednesday,  $10^{th}$  April, 2013.

HON. RAPHAEL G.C. TROTMAN, M.P.,
Speaker of the National Assembly

PARLIAMENT OFFICE,
Public Buildings,
Brickdam,
Georgetown.

9<sup>th</sup> April, 2013.